

that shaped his politics. McGee's book is an important contribution to the historiography, given Griffith's role in shaping the political manifestation of advanced nationalism from 1900. This book is as much a biography of Arthur Griffith as an alternative history of the period from

Parnell's zenith to the signing of the Treaty. As a biography, this book is unconventional, occasionally losing sight of its subject. While crammed with new insights and ideas that will cause historians to rethink certain aspects of Griffith's life, the chapters dealing with the revolutionary

period are problematic and would have benefited from a deeper engagement with recent scholarship on the 1912-22 decade. Some of the author's claims about what may be termed the "revolutionary war," and the factors that led to the Anglo-Irish Treaty, could mislead an unacquainted

reader. On balance, this is a useful if somewhat flawed biography of Arthur Griffith that provides new insights on Griffith's early years, but is less successful in its treatment of the Irish revolution.

—School of History & Archives, UCD

THE IRISH LITERARY SUPPLEMENT IS NOW AVAILABLE IN DIGITAL FORM AT [HTTP://NEWSPAPERS.BC.EDU](http://newspapers.bc.edu)

Some Have Come from a Land Beyond the Sea

BY SUZANN BUCKLEY

WILK'S EXTENSIVELY RESEARCHED and well-written book, which stems from his doctoral dissertation, fills a significant gap in twentieth-century historiography of Ireland and of Irish in the United States. He focuses upon the lives and activism of IRA members who emigrated to the United States after the Irish Civil War to demonstrate that the militant Irish Republican movement in the United States from the mid-1920s to the end of the Second World War was influenced to a large degree by those IRA veterans. In a skillful analysis, Wilk illustrates how the militant Irish republican movement in the U.S. moved forward with "a unique blend of American support and Irish ambitions."

Gavin Wilk

TRANSATLANTIC DEFIANCE:

THE MILITANT IRISH REPUBLICAN MOVEMENT
IN AMERICA, 1923-45.

MANCHESTER UNIVERSITY PRESS, 2014. \$108

Wilk successfully meets the challenge of finding information about the movement, which was sometimes necessarily clandestine in its activities, by locating and mining new sources to capture key issues and personalities in the U.S. and Ireland. One of his starting points is information gleaned from 414 IRA Foreign Reserve applications, which became available to researchers in the 1990s. He uses this material, as well as other recently available local collections and manuscripts, to trace how individual veterans navigated U.S. immigration barriers and other difficult situations to adapt to a new country and to promote republicanism at local and national levels.

After providing a useful summary of Irish nationalists coming to the U.S. since the late eighteenth century, Wilk reviews

the pro-and anti-treaty divisions being brought to the U.S. by Irish emigrants beginning in the 1920s and thus sets the stage for the militant republicans. Chapters 2-5 describe the trials and tribulations of individual IRA veterans arriving in the U.S. from 1923-1926, and provide new information about local leaders of the veterans in New York, Cleveland and Boston. Wilk also provides details about the pressure on those leaders from Fianna Fail leaders to have the veterans join not only organizations supporting the IRA, but also those supporting Fianna Fáil. Ultimately, the veterans and Clan na Gael joined together in 1926 in support for militant action to unify Ireland. In developing this aspect of competition between the militant and political factions for the support by the veterans, Wilk adds to our understanding of Joseph McGarrity's leadership of the Clan and of Connie Neenan's role in initially transforming the Clan movement and creating an identity for it.

In Chapter 5, Wilk also documents how Neenan was especially active in the vigorous efforts to recruit new Clan members, which included taking advantage of de Valera's fundraising trip to the U.S. in 1927 to boost membership in the Clan and resisting efforts by the newly IRA authorized *Comhairle na Poblachta* to gain the Clan's support for a republican political alternative to Fianna Fáil. But in 1933, Neenan and other Clan members who had been instrumental in connecting the veterans with the militant republicans in Ireland left the Clan leadership. Within the year there was a noticeable and growing impatience with the IRA's lack of military action among Clan leadership, and the Clan's membership shifted its focus to other matters, especially the financial plight of many IRA veterans. Wilk touches upon how the newly formed Republican Congress, founded in Ireland by former IRA members who espoused socialist ideas and strongly opposed the de Valera

government, successfully appealed to some veterans to set up branches of the Republican Congress in several cities in the U.S., and in Chapter 6 he discusses other responses of veterans to their dire financial straits. Some returned to Ireland in hope of finding employment or qualifying for assistance from the Army Pensions Act of 1932. Many of those who remained engaged in another transatlantic alliance as sellers of Irish Hospitals Sweepstake tickets in the U.S. As Wilk shows, the business network for this illegal enterprise was helped by Neenan who functioned as the main Sweepstake agent in the U.S. and whose leadership ensured that the Sweepstake provided financial opportunities for the veterans and enabled decades of transatlantic activities by militant republicans in moving arms, money and people to continue through the new Sweepstake channels.

The last two chapters cover the Clan's important role in the bombing campaigns from 1936-1939, the Clan's propaganda and publicity campaigns against the British, and the necessity for restrained action from 1940-1945, given the spying by U.S. government agencies on transatlantic republican networks. Wilk demonstrates that the efforts of U.S. militants to influence and guide the IRA agenda from 1939-1939 were substantial and not just the work of distant accomplices. He also touches upon the reasons such efforts ended in 1940, in particular the outbreak of World War II and the subsequent increased government surveillance of the veterans, especially Neenan. Wilk draws extensively upon U.S. government records of the State Department, the Federal Bureau of Investigations, and the Office of Naval Intelligence to illustrate why the militants had to keep a low profile and to consider different ways to achieve their goal of a United Ireland. In this discussion he touches upon the arguments they used in the propaganda and publicity campaigns and provides useful insights into

the new ways members of the Clan begin to represent their identity as American citizens concerned about the British drain on American resources.

Wilk's far-ranging research is grounded in collections in Ireland, U.S., and Great Britain, which include government documents, papers and records of individuals and associations, newspapers, and interviews. He also makes effective use of secondary literature and internet sources and databases. The latter were especially useful in accessing shipping manifests and census data as a means of tracing the locations and movements of several republican members. A reader may share Wilk's regret about the lack of much inclusion of female republicans. He attributes this lacuna to lack of historical documentation and lists the names of a few known Cumann na mBan members to provide a possible starting point for future researchers. It would also be useful to know more about the connections between the militants and those in the U.S. who didn't necessarily believe in hard line militarism. Wilk briefly mentions in the conclusion that the Clan reached out to Paul O'Dwyer and others in February 1945, and he interrupts that outreach as a sign that the Clan was preparing for a post-war environment in which the campaign for a united Ireland would be conducted by all sections of Irish-America. Might there have been connections prior to 1945?

Wilk's book complements Ely Janis's *A Greater Ireland: The Land League and Transatlantic Nationalism in Gilded America* (2015), and it is a valuable addition to studies of transatlantic efforts for a united Ireland. The narrative fills in an important gap and provides a fuller understanding of activism and identity in the inter-war years as well as a basis for a more complete examination of subsequent transatlantic efforts for Irish unity.

The Bold Fitzgeralds

BY JAMES KELLY

BY THE NORMATIVE standard of Irish aristocratic families, the FitzGeralds of County Kildare enjoyed a longer than average time at the forefront of Irish life, and their history is all the more eventful, and emblematic, for that reason. Established in the immediate wake of the Norman invasion when Maurice FitzGerald (d. 1176), "the founding father of the Irish Geraldines," was granted large tracts of land around Maynooth, the dynasty that emerged was at its most influential in the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries when successive leaders of the family ruled the lordship

of Ireland on behalf of the crown. Famously, and spectacularly, eclipsed in the 1530s when the Kildares' aspiration to remain in the ascendancy in Ireland collided with the Tudors' ambition to subordinate the lordship, they might well have disappeared permanently, like so many Anglo-Norman families and Gaelic clans, but for the adaptability and resolution of successive earls and their wives in the later sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. This required them to embrace not only Protestantism but also the new political order that was brought into being in the seventeenth century, and they did so with such success that their place at the head of the Irish aristocracy was

officially recognized in 1766 when George III raised James, the 19th Earl of Kildare, to the dukedom of Leinster, which was the highest rank in the Irish peerage. Over the following century and a half, a succession of individuals bore the title with varying degrees of distinction until Edward, the seventh in that sequence, was forced by reason of his egregious financial irresponsibility to transfer ownership in 1922 of his family's ancestral home at Carton to an English property speculator, thereby hastening the eclipse of a family that, through many vicissitudes, had contrived across eight centuries to remain at the forefront of Irish political and social life.

Since the family had a mere two decades earlier sold the bulk of the broad acres upon which its place at the head of the Irish peerage depended, it could be argued that the seventh duke just hastened the inevitable, but one of the many virtues of this elegantly produced collection is that it cautions against such facile and reductive conclusions.

Comprising nineteen short essays on various "aspects" of the FitzGeralds and the magnificent eighteenth-century mansion, with which they are inseparably identified, the story of the dynasty and the residences they occupied provides a useful backdrop against which one can pursue the ebb and

flow of Irish history across most of the second millennium.

Patrick Cosgrove, Terence Dooley and Karol Mullaney-Dignam, Editors

ASPECTS OF IRISH ARISTOCRATIC LIFE: ESSAYS ON THE FITZGERALDS AND CARTON HOUSE. DUBLIN: UNIVERSITY COLLEGE DUBLIN PRESS, 2014. €55/£42.50.

The problem is that even the best essays are too short to allow their authors to do much more than briefly outline the main features of the history of the “aspect” of the

family and the house that is their subject. Indeed, several authors all but admit that theirs is an impossible task by presenting their findings as preliminary or summary statements. One can certainly concur with Liam Chambers that the recent archival accession now make it possible to separate the real Lord Edward Fitzgerald from the myth forged in the nineteenth century (chapter 12); with Elizabeth Heggs that the Whig politics of Augustus Frederick, the third duke (1791-1874), are deserving of further enquiry. Yet, this point can be made still more emphatically of Robert, the nineteenth earl (1675-1744), who more than any other made the modern dynasty, and

James (1722-1773) and William (1749-1804), the first and second dukes, whose contributions are not adequately captured in diverse essays on “aspects” of the development and decoration of Carton and its demesne, and on Maynooth by Arnold Horner (2), Alison Fitzgerald, Terence Dooley, William Laffan and Brendan Rooney, and Cormac Begadon. By comparison, the story of the making of the manor of Maynooth (which is traced by Raymond Gillespie), of “the Kildare ascendancy” (retold by Mary Ann Lyons), and of the gradual eclipse of the family as both a political and landed force in the

post-Famine era (related in successive essays by Ciarán Reilly, Patrick Cosgrove, Thomas Nelson, and the ubiquitous Terence Dooley) is more satisfactorily related.

In sum, this is a useful collection. It provides a reminder of the enduring capacity of the story of the lives and properties of the “big house” and their owners to illuminate the flow of Ireland’s history across a millennium. However, as the presence of “aspects” in its title suggests it could, with more careful planning have achieved still more.

—St. Patrick’s College, DCU

Yes We Say Yes

BY SARAH E. MCKIBBEN

IN *Ireland Says Yes: The Inside Story of How the Vote for Marriage Equality Was Won*, Gráinne Healy, Brian Sheehan, and Noel Whelan offer their insiders’ take on the campaign in favor of same-sex marriage, which was passed by 62% of Irish voters on May 22, 2015, the first instance of same-sex marriage being legalized through popular referendum. Written right after this decisive victory by co-directors Healy and Sheehan (aka Bráinne) and their direct advisor Whelan, it offers a first-hand, chronological (though highly Dublincentric) narration of the background and details behind the successful campaign to add seventeen words to the Irish Constitution in what became the 34th Amendment, namely, “Marriage may be contracted in accordance with law by two persons without distinction as to their sex.” The book includes sixteen pages of glossy photos of people and material mentioned in the text, as well as an appendix listing the names of many Yes Equality staff and volunteers.

Gráinne Healy, Brian Sheehan, and Noel Whelan. With a Foreword by former President of Ireland Mary McAleese.

IRELAND SAYS YES: THE INSIDE STORY OF HOW THE VOTE FOR MARRIAGE EQUALITY WAS WON SALLINS, CO. KILDARE, MERRION PRESS, 2016.

Following a short, effusive foreword by President Mary McAleese, herself an powerful player in the Yes campaign, the three Yes Equality organizers begin their narration with the Constitutional Convention that considered the question of same-sex marriage in 2013. Next, we learn of the formation of Yes Equality between 2013 and 2015 and early campaigns such as “Out to your TD” that helped raise visibility. We discover the origins of the slogan “I’m Voting Yes, Ask Me Why” (a Scottish pro-Independence sign spotted on TV) and the details of the political machine built to run the campaign, including the creation of the canvassing army between the fall of 2014 and the vote in May 2015. We hear the story of the Yes bus which toured the country raising awareness and sparking support, key personal stories that influenced public discussion, and behind-the-scenes aspects of the public debates that were held in the spring of 2015. Final chapters discuss the last weeks of the campaign, the results and responses, and offer two statements that

followed the referendum: Gráinne Healy and Brian Sheehan’s remarks on behalf of Yes Equality welcoming the results, and a dignified and consolatory Message from Yes Equality Roscommon, the only county where Yes did not pass.

Particularly for those who were not in Ireland during the campaign, all this conveys compelling details of the proceedings, with the most interesting material found in the central chapters concerning the nitty-gritty of events, strategy and conditions. We hear of the challenge of historically low voter-turnout (as low as 19% among under 25s), the Yes side’s highly effective registration drive (especially among young voters) adding some 66,000 people to the rolls, and epic canvassing feats. The narrative portrays the impressive campaign planning, careful coordination of volunteers in weekly meetings and nightly post-canvassing feedback texts, and marshaling of information in the daily Briefing Book flagging key news items and offering succinct messages for the day, supplementing the campaign’s larger Message Bible detailing Yes Equality’s arguments on all important questions. (One is not surprised to learn that campaigners have subsequently created a three-day Road to Marriage Equality Summer School for non-profits to learn about campaigning for social change.) The text usefully records key arguments employed by the Yes side as well as by their opponents, and discusses how these affected voters and volunteers.

The book also captures the generosity and devotion of volunteers, the widespread embrace of the Yes side by businesses, politicians across parties, celebrities, and ordinary people, such as the 85-year-old man who became the 500,000th person to receive a Yes/Tá badge, Vivian Sheehan, about whom Brian Sheehan (no relation) remarked, “If this charming, gentle man is with us, how can we lose?” We relive the peculiar ways “balance” was interpreted by state media to scant expert analysis while repeatedly giving homophobic mouthpieces a platform despite their noisy complaints of being “silenced.” We identify the anthems of the campaign, such as Cork’s Choral Con Fusion’s “We Love the Same,” “Tabhair dom do lámh,” “She Moved Through the Fair,” the Delorentos’s “Home Again,” and Snow Patrol’s “Just Say Yes.”

We grasp the role of social media along with details about particularly affecting advertisements and viral videos (such as *The Kids are Alright*, “Mrs Brown for Yes Equality” and James Mitchell ringing his Granny to ask whether she would be voting

yes; her emphatic response: “You don’t need to ask me that question. I have been behind you 100 per cent from the day that you came out!”), online campaigns (such as Get The Boat 2 Vote), and popular hashtags, such as the aforementioned #RingYourGranny, the official hashtag #marref, as well as #hometovote, #bemyyes, #makegráthelaw, and #VoteYes, which became the top trending hashtag worldwide on the day of the referendum vote. Memorable tweets and phrases from speeches and debates capture the contemporaneous texture of events, as when Gráinne Healy declared, “We are the family values campaign” early on in the campaign and later tartly remarked that children were already being raised by LGBT parents—“These children already exist. What are we to do with them? Send them to Mars?”—or when comedian Colm O’Regan tweeted that “The #hometovote is like when you are watching *The Hobbit* and the army of elves you’ve forgotten from earlier in the film arrive over the hill.”

We read of market research about appealing to voters, fundraising challenges, major organizational support provided by student and worker unions, substantial opposition by the Catholic Church (though many individual religious supported the yes vote), and instances of creative, often symbolic events used to rally the Yes vote, such as the planting of a rainbow flag on Mt. Errigal in Donegal and the pushing of an eight-foot-high wooden “Yes” in Cavan and later in Dublin in the last moments of the campaign to urge people to make the “final push.” We recall that the referendum was declared passed at 9:12 a.m. the next day, kicking off countryside celebrations broadcast around the world and several spontaneous marriage proposals. The narrative also unselfconsciously portrays organizers’ abiding concern with “tone” and “branding”—the felt need to soothe the mainstream so as not to upset undecided and middle-of-the-road voters, and the embrace of a homogeneous and conservative version of LG(BT) identity and rights mirrored in the narrowing of agenda to a single-issue focus.

All this contributes to an interesting and worthwhile publication. Though hardly the “fast-paced narrative” marketed by its publisher, the book will be of particular interest to activists and those wishing a readable exposition of the Yes Equality story. That said, this book will not satisfy all readers, particularly in its lack of dimensionality or critical purchase. It must be supplemented by Una Mullally’s

compelling and evocative *In the Name of Love: The Movement for Marriage Equality in Ireland: An Oral History* (2014) for historical background, as well as by the brief *Irish Times* eBook of referendum op-eds, *Yes We Do: How Ireland Became the First Country to Introduce Same Sex Marriage by Popular Vote* (2015), and especially by critical articles and blog posts by Anne Mulhall, Aidan Rowe, Sarah Clancy, and Jen O’Leary (amongst others) that capture the conflicted feelings of radicals who chose to support a sharply curtailed, heteronormative political goal and to see the achievement of marriage equality hailed as inaugurating “equality” full stop—in the era of neoliberal austerity and marked, proliferating inequalities in which the adoption of marriage equality serves to pinkwash a sadly regressive political status quo. Ultimately, the book fails to demonstrate a grasp of intersectionality – literally turning away from “a range of policing and criminal justice controversies” it doesn’t bother to detail and blithely accepting the bogus proposition that “equality” was in fact achieved with this vote—what of LGBTQ people living rough or assaulted without redress or trapped in direct provision or deported or drowned while seeking asylum, for instance? This is not a casual matter, for every time LGBT is taken to mean white and privileged, the term and its politics fail at the longer term goal of genuine liberation, equality and justice. Again: acknowledging the pain of homophobia should not mean failing to witness other, contemporaneous, intersecting oppressions and traumas that equally summon us to ethical engagement.

Only briefly excerpted is the stirring Noble Call delivered by Panti Bliss at the Abbey Theatre after being vilified for calling members of the Iona Institute “homophobic” on air, for which supposed hate speech RTÉ hastily paid a large cash settlement in what was widely critiqued as “Pantigate.” Panti acutely dissects the oppressive external and internal effects of homophobia, describing how “you check yourself” in public to see what “gives the gay away” and painfully observing people questioning gay people’s character, rights and humanity:

Have any of you ever come home in the evening and turned on the television and there is a panel of people—*nice* people, *respectable* people, *smart* people—the kind of people who probably make good neighborly neighbors, the kind of people who write